



SFWIB EXECUTIVE COMMITTEE MEETING MINUTES

DATE: December 8, 2022

LOCATION: CareerSource South Florida
 7300 Corporate Center Drive, Suite 500
 Conference Room 2
 Miami, FL 33126
 Zoom: https://us02web.zoom.us/webinar/register/WN_gKA-m86nSZSxCXUhvjFhIg

1. **CALL TO ORDER:** Chairman Gibson called to order the regular meeting of the SFWIB Executive Committee Meeting at 8:46AM on December 8, 2022.
2. **ROLL CALL:** 7 members; 4 required; 5 present: Quorum established.

SFWIB EXECUTIVE COMMITTEE MEMBERS PRESENT	SFWIB MEMBERS ABSENT	SFWIB STAFF
1. Canales, Dequasia (Zoom) 2. del Valle, Juan-Carlos, Vice-Chairman 3. Ferradaz, Gilda (Zoom) 4. Gibson, Charles, Chair 5. Roth, Thomas “Tom”	6. Loynaz, Oscar, M.D. SFWIB EXECUTIVE MEMBERS EXCUSED 7. Chi, Joe	Beasley, Rick Bennett, Renee Gilbert, David (Zoom) Morgan, Ebony Smith, Robert ADMINISTRATION/IT Almonte, Ivan
OTHER ATTENDEES		
Dalto, Joseph, New Horizons Gallo, Ulisse, EconoView/Dun & Bradstreet Rodanes, Carlos, New Horizons		

Agenda items are displayed in the order they were discussed.

2A. Approval of Executive Committee Meeting Minutes – November 17, 2022

Chairman Gibson presented agenda item 2A. November 17, 2022 Executive Committee Meeting minutes for approval.

No questions or comments were presented for consideration.

Motion by Vice-Chairman del Valle to approve the SFWIB Executive Committee meeting minutes from November 17, 2022.

Ms. Canales seconded the motion; **item is passed without dissent.**

3. Information – Fiscal Audit Update

Chairman Gibson introduced the item; Mr. Beasley further presented.

The Finance Committee will receive a report on the audit's progress in December, according to Mr. Beasley. The audit is proceeding well; however, we are awaiting a Leave Balance Report from Miami-Dade County Payroll. The County has made the switch to a new enterprise resource management (ERM) system. As with any transition, there have been a few operational glitches that have made it a bit challenging to quickly extract data from the system. Even though SFWIB employees have escalated the matter through the right County channels, we are still unable to obtain the report, although they are working on it.

Normally, the Board reviews and approves the submission of audit results at the December board meeting. Due to the previously mentioned delay, SFWIB staff will recommend to the Finance Committee in December that we bring the results back to the Executive Committee in January 2023 for review and authorization to submit the final report to the Federal Audit Clearing House by the January deadline. The audit report will be presented to the full board at the meeting in February 2023 to ensure they are aware of the results and any potential recommendations and/or findings.

No further comments or suggestions were submitted from the members. Item closed.

4. Information – EconoVue Policy

Chairman Gibson introduced the item; Mr. Beasley and Mr. Gilbert further presented.

As conversations about the EconoVue platform continue, the SFWIB developed usage guidelines and criteria for the Outreach Team, which consists of Business Services employees, American Job Centers (AJC's), and Business Intermediaries. The Executive Committee expressed concerns about the tool's potential for misuse (or lack thereof) prior to its probable purchase and implementation. The policies presented will ensure the cooperation, application, and compliance of SFWIB staff members and the businesses that have been granted licenses by the SFWIB.

Mr. Gilbert added that the aforementioned policy and procedure outline the parameters whereby license holders will employ the system to perform targeted outreach to businesses in their respective regions. Several types of system search examples are provided to ensure that users can easily locate organizations that may require CSSF services based on their



performance and location in the business lifecycle (e.g., contraction, stable, growing, etc.) and specific demographic characteristics (e.g., minority and/or veteran-owned).

Mr. Gilbert discussed the Level One Service and general outreach statistics for CSSF from the previous year. Mr. Beasley added that the target number of employers we are to engage has been increased to 20,000. The REACH Act establishes business requirements for all local workforce development boards (LWDB), one of which is that we must increase the number of organizations we serve, with at least 35% of those businesses receiving Level One Services. The policy defines the number of employers that each AJC and Business Intermediary must contact and serve to ensure that all parties are aware of their obligations.

There was continued discussion around the proposed policy and platform usage.

Chairman Gibson inquired as to whether the EconoVue Platform's information is updated in real time. Mr. Beasley discussed how the information accessible through EconoVue is typically made available - WARN (Worker Adjustment and Retraining Notification) filings are typically how we learn that a company may be faltering. This program will allow CSSF staff to provide aid before an organization is forced to lay off employees or close its doors permanently.

The agenda packet for the Executive Meeting held on November 17, 2022 incorporates the proposed EconoVue Policy and Procedures, which has been posted online via the CSSF website for public review.

No further questions or comments were presented for consideration. Item closed.

5. Approval – EconoVue Data Platform License Purchase

Chairman Gibson introduced the item; Mr. Beasley reviewed the platform's history within the agency and the access offered through the State-funded contract with EconVue. Mr. Ulisse Gallo of EconoVue/Dun & Bradstreet was then introduced to complete the demonstration of the technology.

Chairman Gibson inquired about the frequency of data updates. Mr. Gallo clarified that data is updated quarterly. Information conveyed via the EconoVue platform is the result of Dun & Bradstreet's cloud-based analytics and data. Information on legal proceedings, liens, judgments, UCC filings, business registries and the like is extracted from over 30,000 different sources and used to do predictive analytics to calculate risk.

Mr. Gallo explained on the Financial Stress Score, which is used to determine an organization's financial health. Levels 1-3 are categorized as low risk, level 4 is medium risk, and an FSS score of five indicates that the organization is at a high risk for failure and may cease operations within the next twelve to eighteen months. This real-time, behind-the-

Minutes Prepared by: Ebony Morgan
SFWIB Executive Committee Meeting
December 8, 2022, 2022, 8:15am

Status: **APPROVED**

Approval date: February 9, 2023

Page 3 of 7



scenes data tracking enables decision makers to better comprehend the business life cycle stage of an organization.

Mr. Beasley elaborated on the correlation between the Financial Stress Scores and CSSF's level of engagement. American Job Centers should focus on business that fall within Levels 1-3, which are considered low risk, by processing job orders, hosting job fairs, and organizing business round tables to assess employment needs. Our business intermediaries – the various chambers of commerce with which we have contracts – should become engaged at Level 4, medium risk, with the aim of providing resources that may prevent layoffs (i.e., Layoff Aversion Program, technical assistance, access to loans, etc.). Level 5 risks will be managed at CSSF headquarters. Our Rapid Response Coordinator (under recruitment) would either implement a short-term compensation program or work with the employer to transition employees into new roles outside the organization and introduce Rapid Response activities (childcare via ELC, housing assistance, etc.) to further stabilize employees throughout the process. The objective is always to reach the employer at Level 4 – before they transition to a more severe level that will result in mass layoffs, a WARN notice, or the business closing permanently.

Vice Chair del Valle requested clarification on the Career Centers' predetermined objectives. Mr. Beasley stated that each center has been assigned goals and reiterated that they are required to achieve a target of 35% for level one associated activities (such as job fairs and recruitment). He described the manual process that has been used to engage employers over the years (e.g., job board postings and help wanted signs). The EconoVue tool will provide staff with specific targeting information that will allow them to be more proactive. In addition, the provided information could provide staff with a targeted audience for business roundtables seeking to comprehend employment trends and needs in the Miami-Dade/Monroe County region.

Mr. Beasley reviewed the cost and user specifications for the EconoVue/DEO contract that was rolled out to all local workforce development boards. Each board received two licenses which offered limited system access. CSSF has requested to reduce the number of licenses for purchase from 30 to 18. Nine for the centers, six for the Business Intermediaries, additional three for headquarters. Mr. Gallo reviewed the new pricing structure under the new conditions.

Mr. Gallo clarified that the pricing structure at Dun and Bradstreet is not per license, but per record. The Miami-Dade/Monroe County region consists of 262,897 businesses; the SFWIB will have access to all records at a cost of \$0.53 per record. Data consists of, but is not limited to, leadership names, contact information, location, business financial analytics, historical financial data, and so on.

Mr. Beasley inquired about the possibility of reducing the number of records accessible to the Board in an effort to lower the cost. Mr. Gallo explained that Dun and Bradstreet's pricing is not designed to accommodate the proposed pricing structure; however, the overall cost can be reduced. Using the same NASPO pricing structure offered to DEO, a three-year term at a discounted rate of \$500 per password would result in a cost of \$422,778 (\$140,926 per year). If the board were to reduce the number of available passwords to eighteen (18), the cost would decrease by \$18,000, bringing the total cost for three years to \$406,676 (approximately 136K per year).

Chairman Gibson clarified that the price of \$406,676 is for 36 months, and Mr. Gallo concurred. If the Board approves the 36-month term, the price will include a 10% discount for the first year and a 5% discount for the remaining months. It is important to note that the current proposal reflects 2021 prices; not the 22% price increase implemented in 2020. As stated justifications for the most recent price increase, he described a number of platform modifications and newly accessible data points.

Mr. Roth inquired as to the number of local workforce boards in Florida presently utilizing the EcoVue platform. Mr. Gallo explained that no Florida workforce boards are currently utilizing the platform; however, the following states do: California, Washington State, Tennessee, and Massachusetts. At the local level, the Oregon, East Cascade Road Valley, Prince George's County, New Mexico, and Arundel County workforce boards. No matter the location, the pricing model is the same – based on the number of records.

The pricing structure and how it could be adjusted remained a topic of ongoing conversation. Mr. Beasley reported that the price estimate from December 2021 was \$132,009 for two users. A second quote for the addition of six passwords in was requested February 2022; the price was \$138,000 for one year.

Mr. Roth understands that, because the product is unique, the procurement requirement can be waived; however, he wants to be fiscally responsible. In addition, he expressed concern regarding the platform's use and the possibility that users, unfamiliar with the product, will not utilize it as intended. Mr. Beasley explained that the business service representatives currently use a manual process to engage with local businesses. We are required by law to interact with and provide services as required. The EconoVue platform will enable them to achieve their specific goals more quickly and efficiently.

Mr. Roth acknowledged Mr. Beasley's point and stated that he concurs, but would prefer to scale up gradually as opposed to purchasing thirty passwords all at once. That way, you can track staff utilization and platform performance before scaling up. Taking this approach would make it possible to track staff utilization and platform performance prior to scaling up. Mr. Beasley disclosed that the original purchase request for 30 passwords was intended to provide access to Career Service personnel – we have contracts with Miami Dade College,

St. Thomas, and Florida Memorial University – all of whom would have received passwords. He has reduced the number of passwords requested to eighteen (18) as a result of discussions with the Executive Committee, hearing their concerns, and being cognizant of the issues raised.

Mr. Roth wanted to know who had access to EconoVue the previous year and what their experience was. Mr. Beasley revealed that Mr. Robert Smith and Ms. Alicia Thompson were identified as staff members to receive access. Mr. Smith provided an overview of his experience; however, because access was restricted to Rapid Response activities only, it was not possible to provide in-depth reference. Additionally, he stated that there was little staff could do to assist struggling organizations trying to stay afloat, given we are often unaware of a problem until a WARN notification is issued.

Mr. Roth inquired about usage frequency. Mr. Smith reported that the platform was employed on a daily basis; however, as previously mentioned, there were restrictions. In addition, the state monitored program usage and could revoke access if it was determined that the program was being misused. There were no state-issued usage guidelines available for reference. The CSSF staff began drafting a policy; however the contract expired before it was completed.

Chairman Gibson inquired if CSSF personnel has identified the records necessary to ensure compliance with REACH Act requirements. Mr. Beasley explained that each AJC is assigned specific zip codes and is responsible for interacting with businesses in that area. There was ongoing discussion regarding the number of available records and the possibility of limiting staff access; however, the pricing structure and program coding is not based on zip code. In addition, Mr. Beasley reminded the Executive Committee that all records must be accessible to CSSF business intermediaries and Career Centers located on college campuses.

Vice-Chairman del Valle asked if it is possible to reduce price by limiting features and, if the state renews the state-wide contract, what will happen to any contracts signed by local workforce boards? Mr. Beasley reminded the Committee that state access is limited to Rapid Response Activities. If the state renews, Mr. Roth advised, there will be redundant features available; we should not be double charged. According to Mr. Gallo, the modules are interconnected; features cannot be separated. Regarding the State contract, Dun and Bradstreet would be willing to return to the negotiation table in an effort to reduce the rate further.

Members of the **Executive Committee would like to limit the purchase to eighteen (18) passwords for a one-year term, with the option to scale up once usage data is received and analyzed.** To ensure accurate measurements, staff will need to create a report comparing current performance data (number of businesses engaged, number of Level One services performed, market penetration rates, etc.) to performance after the first year of



using the EconoVue platform. Mr. Gallo confirmed that he is able to track usage as requested and will be responsible for following up with those who have been assigned passwords but have used the program infrequently. It is important to note that users may have differing usage rates based on their goals and objectives.

The Executive Committee asked for Dun and Bradstreet's guarantee of the following:

- 18 passwords, 1 year contract with the ability to cancel if requested without penalty; and
- If the contract is renewed, the same pricing structure will be honored; and
- A 20% increase in cost will not occur upon renewal; and
- If the state renews its contract, Dun and Bradstreet would be willing to modify our contract to discuss a possible reduction (or credit) in cost due to the duplicative nature of some of the program offerings.

Mr. Gallo concurs and has agreed to revisit the contract if the state renews.

Ms. Ferradaz suggests conducting a cost-benefit analysis when considering renewal.

Motion by Vice-Chairman del Valle moved to recommend to the Board the approval to allocate an amount not to exceed \$143,009.35 in Workforce Innovation and Opportunity Act (WIOA) funds for a one-year, eighteen (18) user contract with Dun and Bradstreet for the EconoVue platform.

Mr. Roth seconded the motion; **item is passed without dissent.**

No further questions or comments were presented for consideration. Item closed.

New Business

YouthBuild Pre-Apprenticeship

Vice-Chairman del Valle advised that DOL has recently released the YouthBuild pre-apprenticeship program.

Mr. Beasley advised that two of the colleges and three not-for-profits (i.e., OIC of South Florida, Gang Alternative, and Greater Miami Service Corp) have YouthBuild grants. CSSF typically partners with them and provide letters of support.

Mr. Gilbert believes that we would fare better as a sub-recipient to do business outreach and development, subcontracting as business intermediaries for the organizations that have been approved for the YouthBuild grant.

No further questions or comments were presented for consideration. Item closed.

With no further business presented to the Committee, the meeting adjourned at 10:36 am.